

**MINUTES OF THE CITY OF HOLLADAY
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING**

**Tuesday, February 21, 2012
6:30 p.m.
Holladay Municipal Center
4580 South 2300 East**

ATTENDANCE

Planning Commission Members:

Les Chatelain, Chair
Spence Bowthorpe
John Garver
Troy Holbrook
Lori Khodadad
Paula Lowry
Matt Snow

City Staff:

Paul Allred, Community Development Director
Rick Whiting, City Planner

PRE-MEETING/WORK SESSION – All Agenda Items May Be Discussed.

(18:36:30) The various agenda items were reviewed and discussed. Items addressed at the most recent City Council Meeting were reviewed as well as the details of the Carmelite Monastery request and revisions made to the previous plan.

CONVENE REGULAR MEETING

Chair Les Chatelain called the Regular Meeting to order at 6:57 p.m.

ACTION ITEMS

1. Public Hearing – Text Amendment – Holladay Village Zone – Planner: Paul Allred.

(18:57:25) Community Development Director, Paul Allred, presented the staff report and stated that the request is from the City Council to have the Planning Commission consider an amendment to the Holladay Village Zone. He pointed out that City Hall is in the Holladay Village Zone. The intent is on major streets in the Village (consisting of Murray Holladay Road, 2300 East, and Holladay Boulevard) to require uses on ground floor levels that face the street to be non-residential or commercial only. The concept was discussed by the Council a few months earlier and it was suggested that the PC look into the concept and consider a text amendment addressing this issue. The objective of the proposed amendment is to protect street level floor spaces and thereby the city's tax base. Staff drafted a proposal to that effect. Staff discussed the matter previously with the Planning Commission as well as the possibility of having the same rule apply on the short section of Laney between 2300 East and the Spin Cycle building which is on the corner of Holladay Blvd and Laney.

Commissioner Lowry recalled that at that time concerns were raised about potential unintended consequences. Mr. Allred explained that whenever a change is considered to ordinances that are already in place, there can be unintended consequences. At this time, he did not see a down side to the proposed amendment. His only significant concern had to do with proposing an amendment that went well beyond what was requested by the Council.

(19:09:40) Chair Chatelain opened the public hearing. There were no public comments. The public hearing was closed.

Chair Chatelain remarked that often recommendations forwarded to the City Council are changed to meet their desires. The current change, as written, is as close as possible to what was sought by the Council. He pointed out that, if needed, additional changes can be made at a later date.

A question was raised with respect to how much of 2300 East will be affected by the amendment. Mr. Allred stated that the HV zone boundary ended on the back side of the City Hall property. The boundaries of the HV zone were identified for the Commission on a map.

There was some question about Laney Avenue and the long-term plan if there were changes made to the Dive Utah space and the single-family home on the corner that is part of Block 1. Commissioner Holbrook questioned whether more should be done with Block 1 and identify what it should be since it (Block 1) is the nucleus of the Village Center area. Another option was to address it on the first pass to be the roads identified. Mr. Allred stated that what is proposed is what the Council asked for. That does not mean, however, that the Planning Commission and staff should not continue to consider the issue independent of the Council. One option was to forward a recommendation to the Council on Block 1 and the Mid-Block Road to address the text amendment at hand. The Commission could also suggest they look at the Mid-Block Road and perhaps as far down as 2225 East. A second option was to send a text amendment forward and suggest the Council look more closely at Block 1 and the Mid-Block Road and how this might apply.

(19:21:58) *Chair Chatelain moved to approve the proposed text amendment to Section 13.71, Holladay Village Zone, regarding a requirement of commercial uses only on the street level space of buildings facing 2300 East, Holladay Blvd, and Murray Holladay Road as proposed including the following additions or modifications to the text (if any) based upon and including the following:*

1. *Move the text amendment from the Vision Purpose Section into the Development Standards Table.*
2. *There should be consideration of how this rule could be applied to Laney west of the Mid-Block Road all the way to 2225 East.*
3. *Include a portion of Laney Avenue from 2300 East to Holladay Boulevard. There should also be consideration of the rest of Laney all the way down to 2225 East. The desire of the Commission was to study the Mid-Block, 2225 East, and the rest of Laney further in the future as part of a recommendation.*
4. *The amendment also supports the purposes of the Holladay Village Zone.*
5. *In the future the Commission should address Laney as a whole and Mid-Block as a potential road.*

Commissioner Khodadad seconded the motion.

(19:26:36) A comment from Commissioner Garver was made about potential residential use on the upper levels of future buildings and the ability to provide access from residential spaces directly on to streets. Chair Chatelain thought it would be acceptable to allow for small lobbies for access to residential floors above and after some discussion he accepted the amendment to his motion to include the allowance for lobby space to upper floor residential at the street level.. The above suggestion was to be sent on to the Council as an attachment to the recommendation made.

Vote on motion: Spence Bowthorpe-Aye, Paula Lowry-Aye, Matt Snow-Aye, Lori Khodadad-Aye, John Garver-Aye, Troy Holbrook-Aye, Chair Les Chatelain-Aye. The motion passed unanimously.

2. Carmelite Monastery – 5714 South Holladay Blvd. – Re-Review Amended Site Plan – R-1-43 Zone – Planner Rick Whiting.

(19:29:15) City Planner, Rick Whiting, presented the staff report and stated that the matter was granted approval on January 10, 2012. The conditional use portion remains in force. The applicant asked to modify the site plan to move the location of the proposed building to a different location on the site. Staff reviewed the request and found no significant issues of concern as it pertains to the site plan, design, etc. The primary organization of interest was Unified Fire Authority (UFA) and the appropriateness of the proposed access. The proposed access would be over an existing dirt road which would be widened and brought up to UFA standards for weight-bearing capability. The revised plan also includes two new fire hydrants along the access road. A turnaround was provided that meets UFA standards. The access road would be gated to discourage public use of the road. It was noted that the road was to be primarily for emergency access. The gated portion would have a lock box with appropriate access for emergency personnel. Both City staff and the UFA endorsed the proposed change to the site plan.

In response to a question raised, Mr. Whiting clarified that the road would not be paved, which is acceptable to the UFA as long as the weight-bearing requirements are met. It was noted that the road would need to support an 80,000-pound truck. The UFA preferred the proposed arrangement to the original layout. The only drawback to the new plan was that two mature trees will have to be removed in order to provide the turnaround.

(19:33:04) JR Howa of Howa Capital was present on behalf of the Carmelites. They considered the proposed site to be better suited for the nuns because it offers enhanced access for emergency vehicles.

Lisa Arnett, Architect, stated that the new building houses ‘cells’, which are referred to as apartments consisting of a bed, a closet, and a sink. There is also a shower, a laundry, a prayer room, two temporary rooms that would serve as bedrooms for convalescing, a library, and an assembly room. The exterior will be built of masonry that matches the existing facility. A second rendering was prepared with exterior wood paneling that also matches the existing building. It was noted that the proposed building is one story in height.

(19:37:02) Commissioner Holbrook moved to approve the amended site plan for the Carmelite Monastery Building Addition at 5714 South Holladay Boulevard subject to the following:

Findings:

1. *The project meets the requirement of the R-1-43 Zone.*
2. *The use at this location provides a service and benefit to the citizens of the community.*
3. *The proposed expanded use is not detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of the people living in the neighborhood.*

The approval is subject to an official letter from UFA for the file confirming that the request meets all requirements.

Commissioner Lowry seconded the motion. Vote on motion: Spence Bowthorpe-Aye, Paula Lowry-Aye, Matt Snow-Aye, Lori Khodadad-Aye, John Garver-Aye, Troy Holbrook-Aye, Chair Les Chatelain-Aye. The motion passed unanimously.

MINUTES

3. Approve Minutes of the February 7, 2012 Meeting.

(19:39:30) The minutes were reviewed and modified.

(19:43:43) *Commissioner Bowthorpe moved to accept the minutes of February 7, 2012, as amended. Commissioner Holbrook seconded the motion. Vote on motion: Spence Bowthorpe-Aye, Paula Lowry-Abstained, Matt Snow-Aye, Lori Khodadad-Aye, John Garver-Aye, Troy Holbrook-Aye, Chair Les Chatelain-Aye. The motion passed unanimously with one abstention.*

OTHER BUSINESS

4. Updates or Follow-Up on Items Currently in the Development Review Process.

(19:45:00) Mr. Allred gave the Commission an update on the Village Center and stated that staff met with the new developer about one week ago who is aggressively pursuing a timeline to complete the project. They have hired a new architect and civil engineer and are working through the various required approvals. Their intent is to perhaps proceed with a portion of the project within 60 days and break ground early this summer on the overall project

Mr. Allred stated that the Sequoia hotel project on 4 ½ acres at 3000 East and 6200 South is underway. The developers are in the process of grading the site and will begin filling in the old storm drain channel shortly, which is their first step toward obtaining a permit for the retail ski/golf shop.

The drive-thru restaurant concept within the project was discussed. Mr. Whiting stated that the developer received a weak response from restaurateurs and is now rethinking the marketing strategy for that particular pad.

In response to a question raised by Chair Chatelain, Mr. Allred confirmed that the new Fire Station to be located on Murray Holladay Road will go through normal approval procedures with the Staff and the Planning Commission. He stated that the Fire Station Master Plan was adopted in 2010 and will serve as a guide for the overall development. An architect has been selected and will be moving forward very quickly. Mr. Allred stated that four finalists were interviewed for the Fire Station Project before selecting one. He was very impressed by the quality of the teams who participated and expected the City to get a very attractive and functional fire station

that residents will be proud of for many ears to come. It was clarified that the Fire Station, the Village Center, and the hotel project should all be built during this calendar year.

(19:50:17) With respect to the Casto home, Mr. Allred stated that there has been debate about whether to relocate it or leave it in its present location on the Fire Station site. Strong opinions were expressed with respect to moving it from the site and away from the fire station. Others suggested it be left in its present location and used for some useful purpose. To Mr. Allred's knowledge, the Council had not yet made a final decision. If relocated, Mr. Allred's opinion was that the most logical place to move it would be to City Hall. Chair Chatelain asked about the historical significance of the home. Mr. Whiting stated that it is on the Historical Register and the Historical Society paid the majority of the cost of moving it to its current location. Mr. Whiting pointed out that the Fire Department is not enthusiastic about the idea of leaving the home in its present location. They would prefer it be moved so they have better turning radii for their equipment in and out of the station. Mr. Allred's understanding was that the Fire Department would prefer to have the trucks go in and out of the station approximately where the Casto Home is sitting. The question was how to move it, how much relocation will cost, where it will be relocated to, and what will be done with it. Mr. Whiting stated that the interior of the home has been modified and was described as having a 1970s motif. It was noted that the historical value of the home stops at the exterior of the building at this point.

(19:55:20) It was acknowledged that several projects are coming forward and there has been an increase in development activity in the City. Mr. Allred stated that residential activity is very heavy, currently. The Council asked staff to renew its efforts on the Sign Ordinance after a recent discussion about A-Frame signs in the Village. The Council also asked staff to address ORD and HV signs. Signage issues were discussed. Mr. Allred stated that Park City recently liberalized their sign ordinance. In the past they were considered hyper restrictive and allowed only carved wooden signs. It was noted that Holladay's HV sign regulations are based on what Park City had. He agreed to provide the Commission with a draft as soon as possible. Mr. Allred reported that the basic components of the new Village site plan are already laid out in the development agreement so the conceptual site plan approval process should go fairly quickly. The fine detail will be reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission.

(20:00:55) Rick Whiting addressed a two-lot subdivision discussed at a previous meeting where the HOA was concerned about what was proposed. He stated that the applicant has since withdrawn his application because of the significant concerns raised. The applicant decided to resell the property and not pursue development of a second lot.

With respect to the Deerwood project, Mr. Gunnell is traveling extensively and has a new representative assisting him while he is away. Mr. Whiting stated that concurrent with the road width exception issue approved at the City Council Meeting - an abutting property owner has come forward and asserted that he owns a section of the private road and that he would not grant required access to Mr. Gunnell for the subdivision. Mr. Gunnell has documentation as well as the complainant supporting their ownership. The two parties are trying to determine the actual status of the subdivision access. The posture the City has taken is that the parties need to resolve the issue before it comes back to the Planning Commission for preliminary plat approval.

(20:03:11) Mr. Allred updated the Commission on a meeting held earlier in the day with consultants for Wasatch Front Regional Council and UTA on a network (transit) study. He

stated that while the Cottonwood Mall is on hold, when it is built it will include well over a million square feet of mixed-use development. There is further build out potential in Cottonwood Heights. The gravel pit area also contains a few more than two hundred acres of potential mixed use. The new Canyon Slope Square (hotel), Tavaci, and Mill Rock areas were also coming forward. In the two larger commercial nodes alone there is the potential for significant redevelopment and development that will probably change traffic patterns. Transit options were discussed. Mr. Allred stated that planning needs to occur now, well in advance of development, to handle transit needs when the projects are built out. Consideration also needs to be given to what energy costs will be 10 to 20 years in the future. The City has made it known that Holladay, Cottonwood Heights, and the Millcreek areas should be planned for a street circulator system between large commercial activity centers.

Mr. Allred stated that Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) is planned on 1300 East, which is a dedicated bus lane with a spur from there to the Mall. There will also be a Murray Holladay/Taylorville/4500 South bus line, which will be enhanced. He stressed the need to think about large activity centers within the City. Commissioner Khodadad commented on the traffic patterns on 6200 South and Wasatch Boulevard, which she described as a nightmare. Mr. Allred indicated that there are two studies taking place currently. One is a north-south corridor mass transit network study. The main concern expressed by Holladay to the consultants in this study is to get an on/off northbound addition on the 4500 South connection with I-215 which is now only a ½ interchange. He noted that efforts are being made to ensure that the City's long-range traffic and transportation needs are met. Mr. Allred reported that the Highland Drive Corridor Master Plan was approved the previous Thursday. Details of the BRT plan were discussed.

(20:12:38) Mr. Allred reported that Murray Holladay Road is the City's next corridor study. Earlier in the day staff drove with Council Member Sabrina Peterson through her district. The same has been done with Council Member Steve Gunn and will be done with Council Member Piganelli.

Mr. Allred updated the Commission on the proposed design build group office on Highland Drive. He stated that Jackson Leroy has signed all necessary City documents and will be moving forward once all the utilities have been relocated under the proposed building pad.

With respect to a nursery application on Highland Drive by the Mall, Mr. Whiting stated that the rezone request was approved and the applicants will be moving forward with a conditional use permit.

Parking issues associated with Café Madrid were discussed. Mr. Whiting stated that no complaints have been received from neighbors; however, people are parking up and down Spring Lane. The applicant has a parking arrangement with the office building to the north but people are not parking there. The business was doing very well.

5. Report from Staff on Upcoming Applications.

(20:22:00) Mr. Allred reported on upcoming applications and stated that a drive-thru coffee shop use was proposed directly east of Black Diamond on 3900 South. The City was also moving forward with several grant application. Mr. Allred noted that Holly Smith is the City's Grant Writer. A presentation was made at the last City Council Meeting by Chad Mullins from the Salt

Lake County Bike Advisory Committee. Blue Cross may be working with the City on funding for a trailhead or trail improvements in the City in conjunction with Knudsen Park.

Commissioner Lowry commented on people who hold signs and honk and wave. She considered them to be distracting and dangerous. Mr. Whiting agreed and stated that they are also illegal. Mr. Allred stated that this type of is on public property, which is not allowed. It is also a temporary sign that is not affixed to the ground. He explained that the City doesn't allow temporary signs on public property and signs are not allowed to be animated.

6. Discussion of Possible Future Amendments to Code.

ADJOURN

(20:33:31) Commissioner Lowry moved to adjourn. Commissioner Snow seconded the motion. Vote on motion: Spence Bowthorpe-Aye, Paula Lowry-Aye, Matt Snow-Aye, Lori Khodadad-Aye, John Garver-Aye, Troy Holbrook-Aye, Chair Les Chatelain-Aye. The motion passed unanimously with one abstention.

The Planning Commission Meeting adjourned at 8:33 p.m.

I hereby certify that the foregoing represents a true, accurate and complete record of the City of Holladay Planning Commission Meeting held Tuesday, February 21, 2012.



Teri Forbes
T Forbes Group
Minutes Secretary

Minutes approved: March 6, 2012